

APNIC EC Meeting Minutes

Teleconference
Friday 17 March 2006

Meeting Start: 9:05 am (UTC+10)

Minutes

Present:

Akinori Maemura (Chair)
Che-Hoo Cheng
Billy Cheon
Qian Hualin
Vinh Ngo
Kuo-Wei Wu
Ma Yan

Paul Wilson
Irene Chan
Anne Lord
Connie Chan
Gerard Ross (minutes)

Agenda:

1. EC officeholders election
2. Agenda bashing
3. Minutes from last meeting (27 February 2006)
4. Financial report for February 2006
5. ICANN/NRO status
6. IGF update
7. IAB statement on IANA RFI
8. AOB

1. EC officeholders election

- Votes for EC officeholder positions have been received by email from all EC members.
- The office holders for 2006 are Akinori Maemura (Chair), Kuo-Wei Wu (Treasurer), and Che-Hoo Cheng (Secretary).

2. Agenda bashing

The following topics are also to be discussed:

- ITU membership
- dotAsia
- Nomination of staff to EC.

3. Minutes from last meeting (27 February 2006)

- The minutes from the meeting on 27 February were discussed and approved.
 - **Action ec-06-006:** Secretariat to publish minutes from 27 February 2006.

4. Financial report for February 2006

- The financial report for February 2006 has been circulated. It includes comparisons with the budget, but since it is early in the year, budget variances are relatively high.
- There are some significant expenses that will occur later in the year, so they appear underspent in this pro-rata budget comparison. The Chinese New Year also normally affects membership income at this time of year.
- ICANN fees are expensed each year and appear on the balance sheet as an accrued expense, under "liabilities". The majority of current accrued expenses are ICANN fees. When these are finally paid to ICANN, they will be cleared from the balance sheet. There was a request that when the ICANN fees are paid, there should be a note made in the financial report.
- It was noted that there is an intention for an increased level of communication between the APNIC Treasurer and the Finance Manager. The DG requested that until specific procedures are established, all such requests should be sent to Director General.
- There was a discussion of the possible establishment of an audit committee. It was suggested that in setting terms of reference, it would be useful for the Treasurer to review the situation at other RIRs where such structures may be in place. There was a general discussion about the potential membership of the audit committee.

5. ICANN/NRO status

- There is no further progress to report on the NRO incorporation documents.
- The NRO response to the IANA RFI was submitted. It noted that the NRO is not currently planning to submit a response, however the IAB response may now have an impact on that position.
- There was a discussion about IPv4 allocation rates at the RIRs.
- It was noted that there was a recent certificate authority workshop held in the APNIC office for RIR staff and others. There is now an RFC defining a certificate extension for resource certification. APNIC is the first RIR to run a trial of this technology. However, it will be necessary for this to become globally adopted before it could be launched as a formal service. This workshop was intended to help with coordination of certification practices and identify any issues that need to be addressed. There are discussions ongoing about political considerations in selecting a root authority for the certificates, as well as other more detailed technical issues.
- There was a general discussion about how this service may operate in the future. The first major deliverable for this project would be to fully document how the proposed service would work.
- There was a general discussion of the work being conducted by APNIC staff members on standards development and technical support for the certification project.

6. IGF update

- The IGF has announced the dates for the meeting in Athens (30 October to 2 November).
- An advisory group is being established, which is expected to make announcements about the nature and agenda of the meeting. The NRO and RIRs will need a substantial presence at IGF meetings for the foreseeable future.

7. IAB statement on IANA RFI

- The NRO response to the RFI was made in relatively open terms, expressing no current intention to make a bid for the IANA role. Any change to that position would require further substantial discussions at the NRO EC and NRO Board levels.
- It was noted that it would have been desirable for the RIR Boards to have made more substantial responses to the APNIC EC request.
- There was a suggestion of reminding the RIR Boards about the need to clarify certain issues. It may be useful to ask some informal questions to encourage further discussion.

- **Action ec-06-007:** DG to work with the EC Chair to develop some discussion points for the RIR Boards regarding the IANA RFI.

8. AOB

ITU membership

- At the end of March, APNIC's current memberships in ITU-T and ITU-D will expire. As the ITU-T membership had been questioned by the EC previously, the EC was asked for views about renewal of that membership at this time (at a cost of US\$24,000).
- It is proposed to continue ITU-D, as this provides political advantage in certain activities. The main question is whether to continue ITU-T membership. ITU-T has been relatively quiet lately.
- It was suggested that there is no problem continuing the membership so long as APNIC's overall financial situation is in order. It was noted that the renewal fees are in the current budget.
- APNIC is currently in the minimum membership level for both ITU-D and ITU-T.
- Dropping out of ITU-T may have some implications, particularly in relation to access to documents (such as the French proposal relating to IPv6 addressing).
- It was suggested that discontinuing the ITU-T membership would be quite a strong political statement.
- The EC recommended that APNIC renew minimum membership levels in both ITU-D and ITU-T.

dotAsia

- It has been proposed that APNIC nominate CHC to the Board of dotAsia. This was discussed at the last meeting, but the decision was deferred.
- There was an explanation of the structure of the dotAsia Board. The ultimate goal is to have elections, but it is necessary to first appoint an interim Board. This is the responsibility of the initial EOI signatories. Board members will serve in an individual capacity.
- It was explained that APNIC's involvement in this process would not involve any membership fee. Members will generally participate in the governance of the organisation, but the level of participation is up to each member.
- There was a question about the types of development activities that dotAsia may support in the region. It was suggested that it is desirable that dotAsia would work with a range of bodies, but that it would still be possible for APNIC to work with dotAsia on certain developmental activities. It was also suggested that APNIC and dotAsia could enter into an MoU, similar to the type that APNIC has entered with a range of other organisations around the region. This would make a clear statement to the community about why the two organisations were working together and the scope of their cooperation.
- It was clarified that the proposal is that APNIC would first join dotAsia as a co-sponsor member, then nominate CHC to the dotAsia Board, then negotiate an MoU with dotAsia to clarify the terms of their relationship and shared commitment to development in the Asia Pacific region.
- The EC decided, against one objection, to support the proposal for APNIC to become a co-sponsor member of dotAsia.
- The EC decided, against one objection, to appoint CHC to the Board of dotAsia.

Nomination of staff to EC

- There was a discussion about the nomination of Geoff Huston to the APNIC EC prior to the recent election. It was noted that he did not nominate himself but was nominated by a member. It was suggested that if there are concerns about the possibility of staff members being elected to the EC, then there may be a need to propose changes to the

Bylaws. There was a suggestion of discussing this issue with other RIRs to gather more opinions on the possibility of staff serving on Boards.

- There was a request for a draft change to the ByLaws to address these concerns.

9. Next meeting

- To be announced.

Meeting closed: 12:55 pm (UTC+10)

Open action items

- **Action ec-06-004:** Secretariat to prepare a draft response to the IPv6 addressing proposal. **Ongoing** (a response has been drafted by APNIC and has now been shared with the NRO EC. There has recently been a French proposal in support of the Korean proposal).
- Action ec-06-005: Secretariat to publish minutes from 17 February 2006. **Open**
- **Action ec-06-006:** Secretariat to publish minutes from 27 February 2006.
- **Action ec-06-007:** DG to work with the EC Chair to develop some discussion points for the RIR Boards regarding the IANA RFI.